Crossing over through the recording studio: the Island to Island: Traditional Music from Ireland and Newfoundland CD project

Evelyn Osborne

Excerpted from:

Crossing Over
Fiddle and Dance Studies from around the North Atlantic 3

Edited by Ian Russell and Anna Kearney Guigné

First published in 2010 by The Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, MacRobert Building, King's College, Aberdeen, AB24 5UA

ISBN 0-9545682-6-5

About the author:

Evelyn Osborne is a PhD candidate in ethnomusicology at Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada. Her research focuses on musical identity in traditional Newfoundland instrumental music. A performer and teacher, Osborne has taught fiddle and dance on four continents. Her publications include journal articles, academic websites, and archival recording liner notes.
Crossing over through the recording studio: the
*Island to Island: Traditional Music from Ireland and
Newfoundland* CD project

EVELYN OSBORNE

Crossing Over was the theme of the North Atlantic Fiddle Convention’s third
incarnation in St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada in August 2008. The theme
included the physical crossing of the North Atlantic from the Old World Aberdeen,
Scotland, to the New World, St. John’s of the conference itself. It also represented the
crossing over, intersecting, meeting, and weaving together of fiddle related musics,
instruments, traditions, and ideas that rarely congregate.

This article will examine the musical and technological crossing over and
intersections of traditional fiddle musics through a CD project entitled *Island to
Island: Traditional Music from Ireland and Newfoundland.* The title, *Island to Island*,
itself suggests a crossing of water from one island to another but in the case of
Newfoundland and Ireland it also recalls the historical annual crossings of the
North Atlantic made every year for the migratory cod fishery and the crossing over
of Irish culture with emigrants who now populate the worldwide Irish diaspora.
With emigration, Irish music and culture crossed to the New World in the form of
musicians and sound recordings.

*Island to Island: Traditional Music from Ireland and Newfoundland* features
musicians from St. John’s, Newfoundland, and Cork, Ireland. The instrumental
music traditions of Newfoundland and Labrador have always exemplified cross-
overs from the Old to the New Worlds. The fiddle repertoire is based in traditions
stemming from the British Isles, Ireland, and France and was likely first brought to
the island with fishermen and settlers starting in the eighteenth century. During the
eyear twentieth century, radio and recordings transmitted the regional repertoires
of other traditional musicians based in continental North America, which were
often Irish in character. At the time, these were primarily one-way transmissions
into the Newfoundland tradition. The last ten to twenty years, however, has seen a
rise in exchanges between musicians in the St. John’s and Southern Shore regions
with Ireland, particularly Cork and Waterford. This paper will address and examine
the *Island to Island* CD as a twenty-first-century traditional music collaboration
between geographically distant locations, how modern technology facilitated it, the
recording choices made, approaches to repertoire selection, and the reception of the
CD by reviewers. The *Island to Island* project could be viewed as a microcosm of the Irish reaching out to their diaspora in an effort to better understand themselves; of Newfoundlander seeking to explore their heritage whilst also forging their own identity; as well as an indication of the importance of both historical and recent connections between Newfoundland and Ireland on musical, cultural, governmental and personal levels.

**Historic connections between Newfoundland and Ireland**

While the Vikings settled at the northern tip of Newfoundland around 1000AD their residency was short lived. The large island off the northern coast of North America was officially discovered by Europeans during John Cabot’s voyage in 1497. Newfoundland, now part of Newfoundland and Labrador, would eventually become known as England’s first colony and Canada’s last province. As the ‘Gateway to North America’ the island was fought over by the English and French for its strategic military position and rich fisheries. England finally claimed Newfoundland as a colony in 1824, granted the island responsible government in 1855, and conferred dominion status in 1917 under the Statute of Westminster. During the 1930s the island succumbed to war debts and the financial ravages of the Great Depression. The Dominion suspended its constitution in 1934 and joined Canada as its tenth province in 1949.

Throughout the migratory fishing years the Irish played a significant role in the economic life of the island. During the early years, Irish men were recruited to work seasonally in the fishery. Waterford, Ireland, was an important stop for the English West Country boats to pick up provisions and crew. While regular permanent settlement did not occur in Newfoundland until the eighteenth century, many Irish men were hired to fish several seasons and over-winter in between. Mannion has termed this ‘temporary’ settlement, which fits into his model of ‘three modes of migration’ to Newfoundland including, ‘seasonal, temporary and permanent’. Mannion states that ‘for much of its early history, Newfoundland had a highly transient, fluctuating population’; this made it ‘difficult to measure the growth of the permanent population’. A 1752 census noted that the Irish made up approximately half of the total population and, in 1753, quite often outnumbered the English in various communities. Besides seasonal fishermen who decided to stay, the primary Irish immigrations to the island were 1811–1816 and 1825–1833. According to McCarthy, during 1814 alone, ships arrived with seven thousand Irish immigrants. Unlike many other areas of the Irish diaspora, this pre-dated mass emigrations of the 1840s Irish famine which ‘bypassed Newfoundland almost completely’. The majority of the Irish who settled in Newfoundland stayed on the Avalon Peninsula. In St. John’s, many Irish mixed with the English but, in other areas of the Avalon Peninsula, Mannion has described the settlers as ‘by far the most ethnically isolated’ in eastern North America. Today the historic connections of Irish fishermen and settlers brought to Newfoundland from the southwest of Ireland is often cited as the primary connection between the islands.
Peter Browne of RTÉ, author of the Irish liner notes for the Island to Island CD, states that the Irish in Newfoundland were ‘unique among Irish emigrants to North America in that they went there before the Famine’. Des Walsh, who wrote the introduction to the Newfoundland liner notes, explains that until recently not much attention was paid to the Newfoundland Irish as ‘no one really knew we were here’. Historically this was anything but true as, according to Cyril Byrne, nineteenth-century Newfoundland was referred to as the ‘trans-Atlantic Ireland’.

During and after the arrival of the bulk of the Irish population, regular communication continued through the Roman Catholic Church and their educational clergy. As early as 1744, there are records of a Roman Catholic school in St. John’s. The Presentation and Mercy Sisters first came to Newfoundland to establish schools in 1833 and 1842 respectively, followed by the Franciscan Monks in 1847 and the Christian Brothers in 1875. McCarthy explains that the curriculum in the Roman Catholic run schools was based on that of Irish schools and they often used the same text books. He states that, ‘many outport Roman Catholic teachers trained with the Sisters and later the Christian Brothers, the Irish influence was spread to the outlying harbours and did much to preserve the Irish heritage of the old country.’ The Christian Brothers played a big part in disseminating Irish step dance in the province, particularly through a performance group known as the St Pat’s Dancers. The St Pat’s Dancers began in the 1930s as part of the Christian Brothers educational curriculum and were under their tutelage until the mid-1990s when the denominational school system in Newfoundland and Labrador was discontinued. The Sisters were also known for their musical abilities and from their start in Newfoundland were ‘prepared to teach all the fine arts – painting, as well as piano, violin, harp, and, of course, voice.’

Newfoundlanders now count Ireland as part of their cultural identity, whether or not they have Irish ancestors. Of course, the idea that Newfoundlanders have a single ancestry is easily refuted when looking at regions of the island that claim English, French and Scottish heritages. However, as Kristen Harris Walsh has pointed out:

From landscape to ethnic stereotype, Ireland and Newfoundland share perceived and real similarities that have enabled and perhaps encouraged Newfoundland culture to model itself after that of Ireland. Nowhere is that more prevalent than in the arts.

Over the past few decades Newfoundland has been branding itself as ethnically Irish in a similar fashion to Mackay’s ‘tartanism’ in Nova Scotia. Many Newfoundlanders now embrace Ireland as their cultural source and agree with Brian McGinn’s statement that Newfoundland is ‘the most Irish place outside of Ireland’.

The historical connections between Newfoundland and Ireland have been well documented and are quite concrete; the Irish have most definitely been a part of
Newfoundland’s history and heritage. However, not all agree that Newfoundland owes its entire cultural inspiration to Ireland. The Newfoundlander as culturally Irish is contested by some. For example, Terry MacDonald has lamented the painting of Newfoundland music as all Irish considering how many of the songs were of English origin and notes that even so-called Irish-Newfoundland bands usually sing English songs, although they use Irish instrumentals.

**Recent connections to Ireland**

In 1996, the governments of Newfoundland and Ireland signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) to recognize the historical connections between the two islands and to facilitate new endeavours. Signed between the Taoiseach John Bruton and Premier Brian Tobin, it was reaffirmed in 1999 and again in 2004 by Premier Danny Williams and Taoiseach Bertie Ahern. The terms of the original MOU allowed the formation of the Ireland-Newfoundland Partnership (INP) in Dublin and the Ireland Business Partnerships (IBP) in St. John’s in 1999 and 2001 respectively, in order to promote exchanges in business, culture, and education. According to Kristy Clarke, assistant director of the INP, over 200 projects have already been funded. She stated that this is a unique connection for the Irish as MOU’s are usually signed with other national, rather than provincial, governments. In part due to the MOU, collaborative projects between Irish and Newfoundland musicians and artists have become more common in the past ten years. Many of these exchanges focus on the historical link between Waterford and St. John’s which were, for this reason, paired as sister cities. *Island to Island* was one such cultural exchange programme, funded by the INP, which focused on linking musicians between St. John’s and Cork, Ireland.

**Irish music in Newfoundland**

*Island to Island* is far from the first taste of Irish music Newfoundlanders have had. In his article, ‘Stage Irish in Britain’s Oldest Colony’, Pat Byrne states that Newfoundland has seen two Irish revivals, and I would suggest we are now into a third. The first was in the 1940s and 1950s headed by J. M. Devine whose New York connections allowed him to import the recordings of the McNulty family and then the family itself. Devine sponsored radio programmes for thirty years (1944–1974) featuring the McNulty’s music. The family clothing store, The Big 6, also carried McNulty recordings, which they sold by mail order throughout Newfoundland and Labrador. In 1953, the McNultys came to Newfoundland and toured for eight weeks to sold-out venues. Byrne speculates that the ‘hard knocks’ Irish songs such as those sung by the McNultys rang true to the Newfoundland identity crisis of the 1950s, having gone from a British colony to nationhood to bankruptcy to a Canadian province.

The second Irish revival, according to Byrne happened in the 1970s, when members of the Sons of Erin, Ryan’s Fancy, and Sullivan’s Gypsies moved to St. John’s. Ralph O’Brien, of the Sons of Erin and Erin’s pub, spoke of their first experiences in Newfoundland. They became so popular with Newfoundlanders because they
‘sang their songs for them’.31 He went on to say that, at the time, ‘the music was going on at home in kitchens but nobody ever though to put it on stage’.32

Although the Sons of Erin members were Irish, the band started in Toronto. In the 1970s, O’Brien and several other Irish musicians chose Newfoundland as their home. Today, these Irish musicians are credited with starting the revival of interest in Irish and then Newfoundland music. As John Graham of St. John’s newest Irish pub, Shamrock City, explained:

The Celtic revival happened here back in the early ’70s late ’60s when you had groups like Sullivan’s Gypsies and Sons of Erin and you had Ryan’s Fancy. They were the original groups that came here […] So then you had the Ralph O’Brien’s coming over and the Dermot O’Reilly’s, Denis Ryan’s and Don Sullivan of Sullivan’s Gypsies. A lot of them moved to Newfoundland and set up their home here […] They were electricians and plumbers by trade from Ireland and when they come over here they found that there was a market for Newfoundland music, and it was some of the most successful music of the ’70s. Out of those groups, and out of the other traditional musicians who were already in Newfoundland […] you had groups start up like Yellow Dory and Figgy Duff and these bands evolved into what we call traditional Newfoundland music now. But there was always an element of Irish music in that as well.33

Certainly these groups and others influenced today’s musicians. As Jason Whelan, the bouzouki player on Island to Island, observed, his father greatly admired the Clancy Brothers and Tommy Makem: ‘He’d been to seen them, I’d been to seen them, Ryan’s Fancy, we had all the Ryan Fancy records, I’d even met Dermot [O’Reilly] and these people when I was really young.’34 Other Newfoundland musicians I have spoken to explained that they started with Irish music as it was the only thing they heard or could find. Ironically, they only discovered Newfoundland music after they began playing Irish music.

O’Brien’s Music Store on Water Street, St. John’s, also helped to spread Irish music recordings in Newfoundland. The store first opened in 1939 as a used records, hardware, and odds and ends shop. Following Newfoundland’s confederation with Canada in 1949, the family was able to make the transition to a music-only business. Throughout the 1950s and 1960s O’Brien’s carried all sorts of music, including Elvis Presley and Country and Western as well as Irish music. It was not until the 1980s that the local Newfoundland recording industry became increasingly professionalized and local artists produced enough releases for O’Brien’s to have a Newfoundland music section. Now O’Brien’s is a specialty store that carries only Newfoundland and Irish music.35 Gordon O’Brien explained that local releases make up 75% of his stock, whereas the other 25% is Irish. Ironically, since the 1970s Irish music has become more difficult to access. As a small store owner he is now required to use distribution networks in New York rather than dealing directly with labels and artists. This restricts his Irish stock as many smaller, but very good acts, do not
distribute in North America.\textsuperscript{36} Of course, the internet enables musicians to seek out particular players and types of music.\textsuperscript{37}

Other sources of Irish music available to Newfoundlanders during the second half of the twentieth century have included recordings sent by relations in Boston, travelling musicians, television, as well as the ever popular ‘Irish-Newfoundland Show’ on the local radio station VOCM.\textsuperscript{38}

\textbf{Cork musicians in Newfoundland}

Considering all of the connections between Newfoundland and Ireland, one might assume that \textit{Island to Island} is based upon the rich historical relationship between the two island nations. I would assert that, while this history might make Newfoundland and Ireland intriguing places for each other to investigate, the practical sources of this CD date back a mere twenty years when Séamus Creagh (1946–2009) came to live in St. John's. Creagh (fiddle) and Rob Murphy (Irish flute) had come to Newfoundland on tour in 1988 and then returned shortly thereafter to live for five years until 1993. Aidan Coffey (accordion) was also supposed to be on that tour; however, he was unable to go at the last minute.\textsuperscript{39} Marie-Annick Desplanques, who was instrumental in putting together the \textit{Island to Island} project, had already been living in Newfoundland for six years, teaching French and studying in the folklore department at Memorial University of Newfoundland.\textsuperscript{40}

When Creagh first arrived in St. John's there were no regular sessions and most traditional music still happened in people's homes, at festivals, or at the regular folk club night at Bridgett's Pub. Desplanques explained that a few sessions were started but never lasted very long.\textsuperscript{41} Colin Carrigan explained that the session held on the closing night of the folk festival was the highlight of the year.\textsuperscript{42} During their stay in Newfoundland, Creagh and Murphy had a major impact upon the younger generation of instrumentalists in St. John's, many of whom are now in their thirties. Although Murphy attempted to start several sessions, it was the one he started at O'Reilly's pub in the late 1980s or early 1990s which really took hold, inspiring players such as Rob Brown, Michelle Brophy, and Mike Hanrahan.\textsuperscript{43} This particular session ran until 2008 and was one of the most popular in the city. Perhaps because it was led by Murphy, it remained primarily an Irish-based session.

When Creagh left the city in 1993 there were few session opportunities, but when he returned in 2006 he was amazed stating, ‘they’re flying now!’\textsuperscript{44} Desplanques credits this to the fact that once they returned to Ireland there was a regular stream of visiting Newfoundland musicians to their house in Cork. She believes they saw sessions in Ireland and were inspired to bring the session environment back to Newfoundland.\textsuperscript{45} Of course, their friendship with Creagh, Desplanques, and Murphy at least partially inspired their travel. Either way, since the mid to late 1990s, a strong pub session scene has developed in St. John's with, at the time of writing (2008), between three and five sessions a week.\textsuperscript{46} Several of these sessions rely heavily on the international standard Irish session repertoire with few Newfoundland tunes. The majority of the people who attend the sessions are under forty and have
probably had more contact with Irish recordings and Irish instrumentalists, such as Creagh or Murphy, or those who learned from them, than they have with the older generation of Newfoundland dance musicians. The main proponents of this scene were influenced, in part, by musicians from Cork, and several, including those on this CD, have since travelled to Ireland to experience the music for themselves. For them, Ireland is the place to learn and absorb true traditional music. Jason Whelan in particular was struck by the physical similarities between the buildings in Cork and those of Water Street, stating that, if you block out the background, ‘it’s just like St. John’s, I mean it’s identical’. The Cork-St. John’s connection has also been maintained in the other direction by periodic visits back to Newfoundland.

The recent musical exchanges between Cork and St. John’s are primarily due to the influence of Séamus Creagh and Marie-Annick Desplanques. As outlined in her presentation at NAFCo 2008, they sponsored and facilitated many concerts on both sides of the Atlantic. Desplanques showed pictures, posters, and spoke of times when Paddy Keenan and Paddy Moloney came over to Newfoundland to visit, play concerts and meet musicians. Newfoundland musicians also played concerts in Cork; for example, Desplanques showed clippings of Christina Smith and Creagh playing together in Cork in 1991 and photos of the Island to Island musicians performing in Ireland during the summer of 2008. This was the first time the Newfoundland musicians from Island to Island were able to travel to Ireland as a group. It was not, however, to promote the Island to Island CD, but instead it was in support of Graham Wells’s new solo CD. Whether or not this connection is forged on historical notions of ancestry, it is clear that the personal contacts between Cork and St. John’s are thriving and of mutual benefit to both sides.

Musicians featured on Island to Island
The Island to Island disc features eight musicians; three from Cork and five from St. John’s (see Appendix). The musicians from Cork include Séamus Creagh (fiddle), Aidan Coffey (accordion), and Mick Daly (guitar). Until Creagh passed away in 2009, these three played together regularly and Coffey and Creagh had a recording duo. The five Newfoundland instrumentalists include Jason Whelan (bouzouki and guitar), Colin Carrigan (fiddle), Graham Wells (accordion), Billy Sutton (banjo), and Paddy Mackey (bodhran).

The Cork musicians were self selected on the basis that they played and worked together regularly. Selection of Newfoundland musicians was a little more difficult. Jason Whelan, and Graham Wells were the first contacts, partially because Creagh knew them and Whelan is a sound engineer with a studio. Whelan and Wells then selected musicians with which they were comfortable, while considering the desired ensemble balance. The selection of musicians often turns out to be quite an informal process. In a small music scene, such as exists in St. John’s, it could have easily grown to include many more equally talented musicians.
Recording practices
So how does one go about co-ordinating a collaborative CD across an ocean? Ideally, each group should be able to travel to the other country, to rehearse and record, and then launch the album with a tour of both islands. In view of the funding available for traditional instrumental music, this was not possible. As one of the Newfoundland musicians pointed out, ‘playing tunes is an indulgence’ and not what pays the bills.51 Fortunately for musicians and audiences alike, modern recording technology made this project possible.

When Mick Daly was kind enough to give me a copy of Island to Island in 2004, I simply assumed, as audience/consumer, that the musicians had travelled between Newfoundland and Ireland to make the CD. I later discovered that they had not travelled at all, but had instead recorded their tracks in their home cities. The musicians from St. John’s sent their tracks to Cork where selections were made and the mastering was done. Colin Carrigan spoke of this as being a ‘virtual collaboration’.52 With the exception of Creagh and Desplanques, who travelled to St. John’s to oversee the recording sessions, the musicians from St. John’s and Cork did not meet until after the project was finished.

In line with the trend of today’s recording styles neither group were recorded in a formal studio but in their homes. In St. John’s, Jason Whelan oversaw the recording in his mother’s empty living room, with hardwood floors and high ceilings.53 In Cork, they recorded in Mick Daly’s living room which has a futon and many bookcases. This resulted, of course, in different room sounds and consequently the studio which mastered the recordings in Killarney, had to compensate for this, making the Newfoundland tracks warmer and the Cork tracks brighter.54

Both groups chose the same method of recording: they played together and recorded ‘live off the floor,’ instead of recording one instrument at a time, a practice often equated with the polished recordings of major music labels. Why did both groups choose this method? Carrigan stated that it was an aesthetic choice. By playing together, they had the chance to respond or play ‘off each other’. This facilitated their desire to ‘capture not slickness, but life’.55 By playing together they could best recreate the liveliness of the music in its normal setting. Whelan, the sound engineer for St. John’s, explained that ‘a lot of the fiddle and accordion were just done facing each other with a cardioid microphone, which is generally not responsive in the back. It was pretty much just a live performance. We just did a couple of takes of each one and we picked the ones we wanted.’56 The same was true in Cork; Creagh and Coffey recorded the fiddle and accordion together. The only instruments regularly overdubbed were Daly’s guitar and Mackey’s bodhran. Following this approach, there was minimal overdubbing, the major exception to this rule was when Coffey overdubbed an accordion part on one track, in order to play with the St. John’s musicians.

This choice to record in a live ensemble reflects two aspects of the tradition as practised today. First it recreates the ‘session’, or the environment in which traditional instrumental music is currently most often performed. It also reflects
the normal social and musical relationships between these particular players. In Fairbairn’s 1994 paper, in which she researched the origins of the Irish music session, she discussed how it, as an informal group performance context, has overtaken the solo tradition, offering both a venue for socializing and for learning new music.57 Sessions are now found throughout North America, Europe, and Australia, and have been adapted to other styles of western traditional musics including Scottish and bluegrass. In a world of recordings, the session has become the social venue of choice for folk musicians. By recording in this ensemble scenario, the *Island to Island* musicians were maintaining the current social and musical traditions of which they are regularly a part, and which is now found both in Cork and St. John’s.

However, in many ways these musicians were also going against the multi-tracking standards that are widely accepted in all genres of music recording. For example, Porcello has shown in the Austin, Texas, music industry that effects are used to create a feeling of playing live.58 In the *Island to Island* project the microphones seem to have been trusted, more or less, to convey the actual experience. There was very little manipulation during the recording. Instead they simply utilised good microphones, placed at an appropriate distance for each instrument, while still allowing eye contact. Furthermore, there were no headphone mixes, no special effects, and overdubbing was limited.

**Music featured**

So, what music was selected to demonstrate the connections between Ireland and Newfoundland, or more specifically between St. John’s and Cork? The liner notes suggest that the music is very similar, much like a ‘meeting of cousins’. However, from talking to the musicians I believe that they intended to highlight the differences between their traditions as well as the similarities.59 Moreover, they were not overly concerned with following the assumed historical trends by selecting music that was specifically from the regions which are ancestrally related. Instead of selecting tunes specifically from the southwest of Ireland or the Avalon Peninsula of Newfoundland, the music chosen reflected their own tastes and experiences as modern musicians, with the expanded resources to choose from any region within their tradition. That said, the Cork musicians, who specialize in music from the Sliabh Luachra region, which lies on the borders of Cork and Kerry, did play a number of these tunes, but did not limit their choice to that region. In Newfoundland there are not many tunes available in recordings or printed format, which are identified as being specifically from the Avalon Peninsula. For the purposes of this article, I will be focusing on the music selected by the Newfoundland musicians.

The *Island to Island* CD consists of fourteen tracks, split evenly between Cork and St. John’s. Three of these could be considered cross-over tracks (tracks 3, 4, and 10 – see the Appendix). Two showcase the musicians playing music from the other side of the Atlantic. For example, the Cork musicians play two Newfoundland tunes from the west coast of the island – ‘Flying Reel’ composed by Emile Benoit (1913–1992) and ‘Hound’s Tune’ from the repertoire of Rufus Guinchard (1899–1990). In
return, Carrigan and Wells play two Donegal reels, ‘Johnny Doherty’s’ and ‘The Ravelled Hank of Yarn’, from the repertoire of John Doherty (1895–1980). Although the CD appears to be drawing similarities between the two traditions, Benoit and Guinchard have limited Irish influence and according to MacAoidh, Donegal has quite a bit of Scottish influence. Benoit is known to have stemmed from the French tradition within Newfoundland and Guinchard’s music is noted by Russell as having both French and West Country English traits. Track 3 features Coffey playing along with the St. John's musicians on more Rufus Guinchard tunes – ‘Lizzie’s Jig’ and ‘Sam’s Jig’. Perhaps it is here that the virtual collaboration really took place through the magic of the recording studio.

While fourteen tracks were included, many more were recorded. Sutton, Wells, and Carrigan originally got together and did rough cuts of at least sixteen possible sets. They then sent these to Cork where Creagh made suggestions of what should be recorded for the final CD.

I asked each group of musicians how they went about selecting tunes for the CD and the answers were rather different. The Cork musicians all agreed that they recorded a number of tunes which they liked and were playing at the time, and then selected from those. However, the Newfoundland musicians took a different approach. Guided partly by the producer, Séamus Creagh, who asked that they avoid the common Newfoundland tunes, the musicians looked for pieces not currently in vogue and not recently recorded. Carrigan stated that he tried to find tunes that had that ‘identifiably Newfoundland sound’ and Wells said that they ‘made a point of finding tunes that were Newfoundland and off the beaten track’ by looking to old recordings or locally made tapes at O’Brien’s Music Store. Despite their efforts, Coffey said that he had hoped the Newfoundlanders would have played fewer Irish tunes but understood that ‘Irish music is more ubiquitous’ and that it was harder for him to find Newfoundland music as there was not the same amount of ‘easy access’. At the same time, Coffey explained that ‘the structure of the tunes from Newfoundland were different’ and that there were unexpected extra beats.

Newfoundland is becoming known for its ‘crooked’ tunes, or tunes which have too many or too few beats according to the standard sixteen beat per strain format. It is generally accepted amongst local musicians that the asymmetrical beat structures or forms represent the music’s link to the largely historical community dancing tradition. At dances known as ‘times’, the solo dance musicians adapted tunes by adding or removing beats as was needed to accommodate the dancers. These ‘times’ were held during the winter months in ‘outport’ coastal communities up until the middle of the twentieth century. Says Coffey:

I think the origin of that, as far as what I read about it […] was because of the dances that people would have been doing in Newfoundland, they would have adjusted standard tunes and put an extra bar on to accommodate a dance that might have come from Brittany, or whose origins might have been in France.
[...] there’s a mixing of cultures over in Newfoundland, so therefore the music adapted to satisfy the dancing.  

Christina Smith has identified Newfoundland as having a higher incidence of tunes with asymmetrical features than other regions, and many musicians point to these tunes as being identifiable characteristic of Newfoundland fiddle music. There are a total of thirty-one tunes in fourteen sets on Island to Island (see Appendix). Of these, seventeen are presented as Newfoundland tunes with the remaining fourteen being Irish tunes. In total there are nine tunes which show deviations from the standard AABB and sixteen-beat form. Eight are from Newfoundland and one from Ireland, but played by Newfoundlanders – ‘Johnny Doherty’s’. The identification between Newfoundland music and crooked tunes is evidently strong as all four of the Newfoundland tunes chosen by the Irish musicians are asymmetrical. With almost a third of the selections on the CD being crooked, when normally the presence of one asymmetrical tune would be unusual, it seems a concerted effort was made to draw attention to this aspect of the tradition. Also significant is the fact that they were allowed to stay ‘crooked’ and were not ‘straightened’ in an attempt to ‘correct’ the tunes to standard format.

The Newfoundlanders joked that, although they looked under rocks and tables to find lesser known tunes, they feel that most Newfoundland music originated in Ireland. As Whelan, who spent time with Creagh in Ireland playing music in the Sliabh Luachra area of Kerry, stated about the Kerry slides and polkas:

I would go for them all the time. I loved them and a lot of players over there don’t like them [...] its overlooked the relation between Newfoundland traditional music and that. All the Newfoundland tunes, I mean, I’m sure in some form they’re all variations of, or they’re heavily influenced because that was the kind of music that was here.

Billy Sutton also echoed this viewpoint stating:

That’s where a lot of the people that were here over the past 500 years came from. So, I mean like you said there was no radio. It got passed down and I mean people playing at dances, and the tunes might have changed and evolved over the years and changed slightly, but [...] that’s where they came from.

In line with previous opinions, Coffey suggested that Newfoundland tunes might sound Irish because the music reflects the background of the region’s original immigrant population. He also recognized the globalization of traditional music in general and the boom of Irish music in particular stating, ‘[I]t is available all over the world so it’s no surprise, they would have a fair repertoire of Irish music’.  

A closer examination of the tunes selected, however, shows that the Newfoundlanders only included three Irish derived tunes, excluding the Donegal cross-over tracks (4.1, 4.2 – see Appendix). Two of the three have strong connections
to the United States, rather than Ireland, through the popular New York City based ensemble, the McNulty Family, who were standard fare on Newfoundland radio for thirty years. The names have changed whilst on the island but the tracks ‘Kitty Jones’ (8.2) and ‘Mussels in the Corner’ (11.3) were recorded by the McNulty’s as ‘Stack of Wheat’ or ‘Ann Carawath’ and ‘Maggie in the Woods’ in 1950 and 1941 respectively. ‘Maggie in the Woods’ or ‘Mussels in the Corner’ has become the standard Newfoundland tune and particularly identified with the provincial fiddle tradition. It has, however, gone through significant changes since the McNulty’s influence and has an extra beat between the low and high strains, as this version attests. The other Irish derived tune, ‘Pussy Cat Got Up in the Plumtree’ was recorded by Newfoundland’s Wilf Doyle in 1962, but also by the Bothy Band as ‘This is my Love Do you Like her?’ in 1977.71

The ‘Blackberry Quadrille,’ presented here as the ‘Blueberry Quadrille’ (2.3) was popularized by the famous Canadian fiddler Don Messer (1909–1973). Under Rufus Guinchard’s fingers, however, it gained an extra beat and it is this version which is recorded on Island to Island. Four more tunes from Guinchard’s repertoire (3.1, 3.2, 10.2, 11.2) are also included, all but one of which are crooked, as are both of the Emile Benoit compositions (6.3, 10.1). Three recently composed tunes by Avalon Peninsula musicians, Geoff Butler and Billy Dinn (8.1, 13.1, 13.2) and four other Newfoundland tunes (2.1, 6.1, 6.2, 11.1), not traced to other sources were part of the Newfoundland offerings on Island to Island.

For the casual listener, these tunes all sound more or less the same. Even reviewers from publications such as Folk World, The Living Tradition, Irish Music Magazine, The Irish World and The Irish Post remarked on the similarity of the two musics.72 One reviewer admits that he could not tell the difference between the two groups, whereas another suggests that the Newfoundland tunes might be more authentic than modern Irish music.73 Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, all of whom play Irish session music regularly, agree that musicians are more discerning than the general listening public.

Conclusions
So what is the result of this musical exchange? It has been shown that there are deep historical ties between Newfoundland and Ireland, and that recent connections are also very important to musicians in helping to shape the contemporary tradition in St. John’s. As is implied by the authors of the liner notes for Island to Island, this CD successfully demonstrates strong musical links, in that ‘tunes from both traditions blend easily together and there is a unity of sound that could not be contrived’.74 They go on to say that Irish music in Newfoundland has been protected by isolation and that it represents a ‘fairly pure form of the craft’.75 Undoubtedly, there are many Irish-derived tunes in Newfoundland and our tradition owes a great debt in terms of repertoire to Ireland, both historically and recently through travel, visiting musicians, and recordings. However, I wonder how it is that when the musicians make an effort to showcase non-Irish based Newfoundland tunes, including a high
number of crooked tunes, that reviewers regard everything as being essentially Irish. Is it that the musicians are so adept that they make everything sound easy and do not make the extra or lack of beats sound out of place? Does the similar instrumentation fool the ear? Has Séamus, and by corollary his Irish colleagues, ended up with a Newfoundland accent? Or, is it that the post dance generation of Newfoundland players has learned so much from Irish recordings and travel that they can move seamlessly between the two traditions? Or, is it simply that there is such a strong connection, notwithstanding odd structures and newly composed tunes, that our roots show through in spite of apparent efforts to the contrary?

How does this project and others like it benefit both islands? Certainly an international collaboration helps bring the relatively obscure Newfoundland tradition into the international limelight. Irish listeners will learn more about the Irish diaspora, which has helped to fuel so many vibrant traditions around the world. Modern recording technology here has allowed for the meeting of musics that might not otherwise meet on CD for the general public to hear. This could perhaps be used as a model for a virtual meeting of musics from other closely related traditions; it could help to illuminate those delicate questions concerning tune nationality and subtle stylistic differences which are so important to instrumentalists, while providing new musical connections for the general public. Although localization is increasing in response to globalization, it is a fact that technology, be it radio, records, or digital downloads are embraced by fiddlers in even the most isolated of communities. Playing tunes with musicians across an ocean is just another expression of this. As Paul Greene has pointed out in Wired for Sound, ‘music can now no longer be adequately modeled as something that happens in a local context and employs only the expressive means specific to a locality.’

The connections between Newfoundland and Ireland socially and musically have been growing stronger in recent years, fuelled in part by artistic endeavours such as this, which are crossing over and over, while creating a stronger and stronger weave. Without modern recording technology, high-quality collaborations, virtual or personal, could not seek to highlight both our similarities and our differences. Perhaps the casual listeners will not hear extra beats but musicians who sit down from either side of the Atlantic will notice and note the reunion of two long-parted traditions getting to know each other once again.

Appendix

Island to Island CD track list

Séamus Creagh and Marie-Annick Desplanques, producers, Island to Island: Traditional Music from Newfoundland and Ireland, Ossian OSSCD 131, Cork, Ireland, 2003. Irish Artists: Séamus Creagh (fiddle), Aidan Coffey (accordion), and Mick Daly (guitar). Newfoundland Artists: Jason Whelan (bouzouki and guitar), Colin Carrigan (fiddle), Graham Wells (accordion), Billy Sutton (banjo), and Paddy Mackey (bodhran).
Crossing Over: Fiddle and Dance Studies from around the North Atlantic

Track 1 – Polkas (Séamus, Aidan & Mick)
   1.1 Quinn's Polka
   1.2 The Church Polka

Track 2 – Doubles (Graham, Billy, Jason, Colin & Paddy)
   2.1 Cook in the Galley
   2.2 Pussycat Up in the Plumtree
   2.3 Blueberry Quadrille

Track 3 – Doubles (Jason, Colin & Aidan)
   3.1 Lizzie's Jig
   3.2 Sam's Jig

Track 4 – Reels (Colin & Graham)
   4.1 Johnny Doherty's
   4.2 The Ravelled Hank of Yarn

Track 5 – (Séamus, Aidan & Mick)
   5.1 The Job of Journeywork
   5.2 The Moneymusk

Track 6 – Jigs (Graham, Billy, Jason, Colin & Paddy)
   6.1 Captains and Ships
   6.2 Newfoundland Spring
   6.3 West Bay Centre

Track 7 – Polkas (Séamus, Aidan & Mick)
   7.1 Pádraig O'Keeffe's
   7.2 Many's a Wild Night

Track 8 – Hornpipes (Graham, Colin & Jason)
   8.1 Like You Would
   8.2 Kitty Jones

Track 9 – Jigs (Séamus, Aidan & Mick)
   9.1 Tom Billy Murphy's
   9.2 Brennan's Fabourite

Track 10 – (Séamus, Aidan & Mick)
   10.1 The Flying Reel
   10.2 Hound's Tune

Track 11 – (Colin, Graham & Jason)
   11.1 Who Stole the Miner's Hat
   11.2 Hughie Wentzell's
   11.3 Mussells in the Corner

Track 12 – Jigs (Séamus, Aidan & Mick)
   12.1 Kilfenora Jig
   12.2 Thomond Bridge

Track 13 – Jig and Reel (Graham, Billy, Jason, Colin & Paddy)
   13.1 Billy Dinn's Jig
   13.2 Billy Dinn's Reel

Track 14 Reels (Séamus, Aidan & Mick)
   14.1 McGrath's Reel
   14.2 Mulhare's (Martin Mulhare's No. 9)
Notes

1 This paper is a part of my dissertation research. I would like to thank for their generous support: the Ireland-Canada University Fund and the Sprott Foundation which funded my research in Ireland; the J. R. Smallwood Foundation which funded research in Newfoundland and Labrador; and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) who generously offered me a doctoral fellowship.

2 Séamus Creagh and Marie-Annick Desplanques, Island to Island: Traditional Music from Newfoundland and Ireland, Ossian OSSCD 131, Cork, Ireland, 2003.

3 Creagh and Desplanques, Island to Island.

4 Patrick Byrne, ‘The Confluence of Folklore and Literature in the Creation of a Newfoundland Mythology within the Canadian Context’, in Canada and the Nordic Countries in Times of Reorientation: Culture and Politics, ed. by Jorn Carlsen, the Nordic Association for Canadian Studies Text Series 13 (Aarhus: Nordic Association for Canadian Studies and Aarhus University, 1998), pp. 55–77 (p. 56). As discussed by Pat Byrne, the tag line ‘England’s first colony’ is a ‘factive moniker’. The 1583 Gilbert visit was a proclamation of British law, not recognition of colonial status and carried no tangible effect on the people living or working in Newfoundland. With at least a dozen ships of different countries in the harbour, Gilbert’s speech was nominal at best and ineffective at worst. As Harris has pointed out, it was effectively a geopolitical news release to notify the King of Spain to leave North America alone, see L. Harris, Newfoundland and Labrador: A Brief History (Toronto: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1968), p. 36.


8 Mike McCarthy, The Irish in Newfoundland 1600–1900: Their Trials, Tribulations and Triumphs (St. John’s, NL: Creative Publishers, 1999), p. 8.


10 McCarthy, Irish in Newfoundland, p. 120.


14 McCarthy, Irish in Newfoundland, p. 177.

15 McCarthy, Irish in Newfoundland, pp. 179, 182.

16 McCarthy, Irish in Newfoundland, p. 181.
Crossing Over: Fiddle and Dance Studies from around the North Atlantic


18 Corona Wyse, Not Words but Deeds (St. John’s, NL: Flanker Press, 2006), p. 49.


25 Kristy Clarke, interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2008.

26 Clarke, interview by author.

27 Ibid.

28 My current dissertation research focuses on these three Irish revival periods and their influence on Newfoundlanders’ musical identity, see Evelyn Osborne, ‘Fiddling with Style: Negotiating “Celticism” in the Traditional Instrumental Music of Newfoundland and Labrador’ (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Memorial University of Newfoundland, forthcoming).

Pat Byrne, ‘Stage Irish’, p. 67. My forthcoming dissertation contains an in-depth look at the McNulty Family’s tour to Newfoundland and their influence on Newfoundland music, particularly the instrumental tradition, see Osborne, ‘Fiddling with Style’. Also forthcoming is an article by Ted McGraw on the McNulty’s influence on the Newfoundland song tradition (Journal of the Society for American Music, Fall 2010), and a retrospective CD compilation of their music produced by Mick Moloney (due out in December 2010).

Ralph O’Brien, interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2008.


John Graham, interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, 2008. This perception of Figgy Duff’s background contrasts with the account in Lise Saugeres, ‘Figgy Duff and Newfoundland Culture’ (unpublished dissertation, Department of Folklore, Memorial University of Newfoundland, 1991).

Billy Sutton, Graham Wells, and Jason Whelan, interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, 2008.

Gordon O’Brien, interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, 2008.

Ibid.

A popular website for accessing tunes is www.thesession.org [accessed 4 June 2009].

Kevin Broderick and Mark Walsh, interview by author, Bay de Verde, Conception Bay, Newfoundland, 17 March 2002.

Aidan Coffey, Séamus Creagh, Mick Daly, and Marie-Annick Desplanque, interview by author, Cork City, Ireland, 2007.

Marie-Annick Desplanques received her doctorate from Memorial University in 1992. She is now on the faculty at the University College Cork, her biography and works are listed here: www.ucc.ie/en/DepartmentsCentresandUnits/RoînneBhaloidisFolklore/M-ADesplanques [accessed 4 June 2009]. Marie-Annick Desplanques moved to Newfoundland c.1982 to teach French and study French populations on the west coast of the island through Memorial University of Newfoundland’s folklore department. She met Séamus when he came over to perform at Soirée ‘88. Séamus then moved to St. John’s and resided there from 1988 to 1993 after which they returned to County Cork together. Séamus Creagh (b. 22 February 1946) passed on during the writing of this paper at age 63 (15 March 2009). See Irish Times, 16 March 2009, notices.irishtimes.com/2423607 [accessed 19 May 2010].

Coffey, Creagh, Daly, and Desplanque, interview.


Ibid.

Coffey, Creagh, Daly, and Desplanque, interview.

Ibid.

In 2008, the session scene in the city was in flux. To my knowledge there were sessions at Auntie Crae’s on Water Street (Tuesday lunchtimes); at the Georgetown Pub (Tuesday evenings); at Erin's Pub (Friday evenings); at O’Reilly’s Irish Newfoundland Bar (Saturday nights); and at Bridie Molloy’s (Sunday afternoons). NAFCo 2008 also sparked some sessions at Nautical Nellies which have been changing from Thursday nights and Saturday
Crossing Over: Fiddle and Dance Studies from around the North Atlantic

afternoons. Since 2008 the long standing session at O'Reilly's has moved to a new Irish bar called Shamrock City.

47 Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, interview.


49 Ibid.

50 Graham Wells, Traditional Music From Newfoundland, Chain Rock Entertainment [no matrix number], St. John's, NL, 2008.

51 Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, interview.

52 Carrigan, interview.

53 Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, interview.

54 Coffey, Creagh, Daly, and Desplanque, interview.

55 Carrigan, interview.

56 Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, interview.


59 Coffey, Creagh, Daly, and Desplanque, interview; Creagh, and Desplanques, Island to Island; Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, interview; Carrigan, interview.

60 Caomhín MacAoidh, Between the Jigs and the Reels: The Donegal Fiddle Tradition (Manorhamilton, Co. Leitrim: Drumlin Publications, 1994), pp. 22–105 (chapter 3 ‘Influences’).


62 Carrigan, interview; Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, interview.

63 Coffey, Creagh, Daly, and Desplanque, interview.

64 Ibid.

65 Ibid.


67 The following tunes recorded on Island to Island are asymmetrical. ‘Blueberry Quadrille’ (2.3) aka ‘Blackberry Quadrille’ has an extra beat in the high strain in bar 4; ‘Lizzie’s Tune’ (3.1) bar 7 and 15 are 9/8 giving each turn 17 beats rather than the standard 16; ‘Sam’s Jig’ (3.2) includes one 9/8 bar in the A strain and two in B giving 17 and 18 beats respectively; ‘Flying Reel’ (10.1) is by Emile Benoit each strain is only 8 beats long, A is played three times and B twice; ‘Hound’s Tune’ (10.2) the low strain is 9 bars, or 18 beats long; ‘West Bay Centre’ by Emile Benoit has a low strain with a beat structure, including the repeat, of 6+7+6+6 when it returns to the start but 6+7+6+7 on the final turn, meaning it has only 6 bars and is 13+12 beats on the repeat but 13 + 13 beats at the end. These tunes can be found in Russell, The Fiddle Music of Newfoundland and Labrador Volume 1: Rufus Guinchard and Emile Benoit, pp. 4,
OSBORNE Music from Ireland and Newfoundland

12, 13, 17, 36, 56. ‘Captains and Ships’ (6.1) was originally a song and carries a A BB or 8 beats plus 16 beats form; ‘Mussels in the Corner’ (11.3) is normally 16 + 16 beats long, however, this version from Fogo Island has an extra beat at the end of the low strain making it 17+16. Only one of the listed Irish tunes was asymmetrical. ‘Johnny Doherty’s’ (4.1) has nine bars in the first turn giving it 18 beats.

68 Sutton, Wells, and Whelan, interview.
69 Ibid.
70 Coffey, Creagh, Daly, and Desplanque, interview.
74 Creagh, and Desplanques, Island to Island.
75 Ibid.