Putting down roots: playing Irish and Newfoundland music in St. John’s

*Samantha Breslin*

Excerpted from:

**Routes and Roots**

Fiddle and Dance Studies from around the North Atlantic 4

*Edited by Ian Russell and Chris Goertzen*

First published in 2012 by The Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, MacRobert Building, King’s College, Aberdeen, AB24 5UA

ISBN 0-9545682-7-3

About the author:

*Samantha Breslin* completed a master’s degree in anthropology at Memorial University of Newfoundland with a thesis entitled ‘Living with music: An ethnography of sessions in St. John’s’. She is currently pursuing a PhD at the same institution exploring the making of computer scientists as gendered subjects. She completed her undergraduate education at the University of Waterloo majoring in computer science and anthropology.
Putting down roots: playing Irish and Newfoundland music in St. John’s

SAMANTHA BRESLIN

To many people, traditional music originates from and belongs to particular places. In particular, traditional Irish music is often tied to its origins in Ireland and its performance seen as a definitive expression of ‘Irishness’. These connections are made as the music is envisioned to be the same as that played across Ireland’s rural countryside since past centuries. Similarly, traditional Newfoundland music is often tied to its history in Newfoundland. It is seen as the music that was introduced to the island by early European settlers and that has changed over generations to reflect the character of the place and its people. Although ‘Irish’ music has a long history in Newfoundland, some musicians argue that it is ‘Newfoundland’ music and belongs to the island, as opposed to ‘Irish’ music, which belongs to Ireland.

These associations between music and place have a significant influence on how musicians interpret and experience the music they play. Numerous scholars have explored how, through romantic ideas of Irish music’s place in rural Ireland, the performance of traditional Irish music in places outside Ireland often serves as a means to identify with and create a connection to a nostalgic homeland in Ireland. Through these associations, musicians also negotiate different ways of conceiving and representing Newfoundland as a place. Some argue that ‘Newfoundland’ music is distinct from ‘Irish’ music in order to counter the widely held notion that traditional music in Newfoundland is a reflection of its Irish heritage and that Newfoundland is a definitively ‘Irish place’. Interestingly, in this popular conception of Newfoundland and its music, Irish music continues to be tied to an expression of ‘Irishness’ through the idea of an Irish Newfoundland.

This focus on musical origins, applied by musicians and scholars alike, however, overlooks the local and personal connections that musicians create through playing traditional music. This article explores the multiple associations with place that musicians in Newfoundland’s capital city of St. John’s form through playing traditional Irish and Newfoundland music. It is based on fieldwork conducted among these musicians during the spring and summer of 2009. The
research was done primarily through participant observation at local sessions and semi-structured interviews conducted with musicians of a variety of skill levels, backgrounds, and ages. In my research, I sought to understand how musicians defined and distinguished ‘Irish’ and ‘Newfoundland’ traditions and the meanings they attributed to traditional music.

Musicians had many interpretations of what Newfoundland music consisted of and they often debated what its relationship is and should be to Irish music. In this article I explore these debates and show how they use ideas of musical origins to place the performance of traditional Irish and Newfoundland music. Yet, the musicians I worked with also spoke of how memories of specific people and places in Newfoundland became entwined with the music they played. I show how, through the performance of music in places and the creation of these memories, musicians connect their playing with different places in Newfoundland. This occurred regardless of the music’s origins. I also show how, as this process continues through time, music that originated elsewhere is seen to develop roots in Newfoundland. In this manner, musicians’ performance of Irish music is not solely related to Ireland or to ideas of an Irish Newfoundland. The associations that musicians make between music and place are multiple and created in multiple ways.

Music and Place: The Debates
The distinctions between Irish, Newfoundland, and Irish Newfoundland music and their relations to Newfoundland and Ireland are not clear-cut, as Irish music has influenced music in Newfoundland throughout much of the island’s history. The population of Newfoundland, particularly that of St. John’s and the southern part of the Avalon Peninsula, includes many descendants of migrants who arrived from Ireland from the seventeenth to nineteenth centuries. Presumably, even the earliest Irish settlers brought music, songs, and instruments with them and continued to play this music in local communities. Gearóid ÓhAllmhuráin, for example, discusses the presence of Irish language songs on the island that were likely brought by Irish visitors and settlers beginning in the 1700s, lasting in some communities until the 1970s. In addition, local musician Christina Smith observes in her article, ‘Crooked as the Road to Branch’, that Newfoundland music has high quantities of singles (related to polkas) and doubles (related to jigs), which is similar to music in Ireland. On the other hand, reels, which were only beginning to gain popularity in Ireland in the late eighteenth century, originating in Scotland, are relatively rare in the Newfoundland repertoire. These examples indicate the influences of early Irish settlers and Irish music on music in Newfoundland.

More recently, imports of Irish and Irish-American music and musicians throughout the twentieth century have also gained considerable popularity in Newfoundland and have influenced music on the island. Evelyn Osborne, for example, suggests that there have been three revivals of Irish music in Newfoundland during this time. The first occurred during the 1940s and 1950s with the influence of the McNulty family from New York. Their Irish-American music was sold and
played on the radio across the island, and they also visited and performed in St. John’s in 1953. The second occurred in the 1970s when several Irish musicians moved to Newfoundland and started such bands as the Sons of Erin, Ryan’s Fancy, and Sullivan’s Gypsies. These bands toured Newfoundland, popularizing Irish and Newfoundland songs. The third revival is ongoing and began through the influence of Irish musicians Rob Murphy and Séamus Creagh, who moved to Newfoundland in 1982 and 1987. While the first two revivals centred primarily on the popularity of Irish and Irish-American songs (vocal music), Creagh and Murphy introduced their repertoire of tunes (instrumental music) to the city and started the first scheduled pub sessions in St. John’s.

There were numerous musicians in St. John’s who played traditional Irish tunes prior to Murphy and Creagh. In addition to the tunes brought over by early settlers, the McNulty family and the bands of Irish-born players formed in the 1970s did play some instrumental tunes along with their repertoires of songs that remain a part of the current Newfoundland repertoire. For example, the ‘Rollicking Skipper Jig’ recorded by the McNulty family in 1937 was later recorded by well-known Newfoundland accordion player Frank Maher and his band, the Mahers Bahers, in 2005. More significantly, records, radio programmes, CDs, and sheet music also exposed people in Newfoundland to traditional Irish and Irish-American music that was developing in the twentieth century by bands and musicians such as John Kimmel, the Chieftains, the Bothy Band, and De Dannan. Murphy and Creagh, however, introduced the session as a regular performance context for traditional music to local musicians along with their Sliabh Luachra style of Irish music from Counties Cork and Kerry.

These influences have contributed to an active session scene in St. John’s, featuring much Irish music. During my fieldwork, for example, there were, at one point, as many as seven regular public sessions per week, most of them featuring Irish music. As an illustration, the Appendix contains a listing of the tunes played over the course of an hour at one of these sessions. Of the fifteen tunes played, all are contemporary or traditional Irish tunes. In 2010, musicians also organized the first ‘Feile Séamus Creagh’ to commemorate the Irishman’s passing the previous year; the event featured several well-known Irish performers. There were many formal and informal sessions held during this event, demonstrating the continuing connections that musicians establish and maintain with Irish music and musicians from Ireland.

As a result of this long history of Irish music in Newfoundland and its ongoing influences, many musicians contend that Irish and Newfoundland music cannot be easily separated. Several musicians commented that the music is part of a ‘spectrum’, ‘spans the gamut’, and that it is ‘so hard to separate the two’. One clear example, ‘Mussels in the Corner’, considered to be the quintessential Newfoundland tune, is also a traditional Irish tune commonly known as ‘Maggie in the Woods’. In sessions, Irish and Newfoundland tunes are freely mixed in sets, as are contemporary and traditional Irish tunes from a variety of sources (see Appendix), demonstrating
the close interconnectedness of Irish and Newfoundland music at sessions in St. John's.19

The equation of Irish music with Newfoundland music is part of the widely held conception that Newfoundland is an ‘Irish place’. A number of factors beyond the realm of music are cited as evidence of this ‘Irishness’. The apparent intensity of Irish migration along with the impression that Newfoundland remained isolated from outside influence throughout much of its history created the perception that the ‘authentic Irishness’ of the island was preserved.20 This idea is further supported by the fact that the dialects and accents of many Newfoundlanders from some areas are similar to those spoken in parts of South-East Ireland.21 Even the design, colouring, and meanings associated with the Newfoundland tri-colour flag (popularly called the ‘Republic of Newfoundland’ or the ‘Newfoundland nationalist’ flag) are reminiscent of the flag of the Republic of Ireland.22 In 1996, the Newfoundland and Ireland governments affirmed such connections through the signing of a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU). This led to the formation of the Ireland Newfoundland Partnership (INP) and Ireland Business Partnership (IBP), which aim to support business and cultural exchanges between the two nations and reinforce the idea of an essential connection between Newfoundland and Ireland.23 The performance of traditional music in Newfoundland is thereby popularly seen as a reflection of the ‘Irishness’ of the island.

While most people in Newfoundland acknowledge these historical connections between Ireland and Newfoundland, many also contest the idea of Newfoundland music’s essential ‘Irishness’.24 Music in Newfoundland has origins in several places other than Ireland, including England, Scotland, and France.25 More specifically, the English began to settle along the east coast of Newfoundland around 1575, after their fleets were attracted to the area for its fishing grounds. They were soon followed by the French, who settled many areas north and south of English settlements.26 Settlers from these and other areas continued to arrive in Newfoundland throughout its history. Highland Scots, for example, settled on the south-west coast of Newfoundland from the 1840s to 1860s.27 Although common tropes portray Newfoundland as being remote and isolated, Newfoundland music has continued to be influenced by music from these places and elsewhere throughout its history. A popular tune played in Newfoundland as ‘Auntie Mary’, for example, most likely has origins in Scotland where it is known as ‘Cock of the North’.28 In addition, Newfoundland fiddlers Émile Benoit and Rufus Guinchard are considered to be influenced by the French-Newfoundland tradition and by the French and West Country English traditions, respectively.29 As a result of the aural process and some amalgamated settlement, the variety of music that was brought to Newfoundland by early settlers blended and changed over time. One musician explained he had once been told ‘it’s like you put it in a bowl for two hundred years and just kept stirring it and then poured it out’.30 The music that was ‘poured out’, along with local compositions, is generally considered to be ‘traditional Newfoundland music’.

Many musicians argue that this music has become rooted in Newfoundland through its independent development over the centuries to reflect the character of
the people and the place. Newfoundland musician Christina Smith, for example, discusses how Newfoundland has a high quantity of ‘crooked’ tunes. A crooked tune is one that does not fit within a symmetrical set of eight bars, seen as ‘normal’ for most dance tunes. The tunes have extra or fewer beats added at the beginning or the end of a strain. Wayne, a professional musician from Newfoundland, for example, explained:

But Newfoundland tunes […] there’s lots of little twists and turns in them, you know, like extra bars and extra beats. […] Like off the surface you’d just say they’re fucked up Irish tunes and if you can’t get past that you may never appreciate them.

A version of ‘Mussels in the Corner’ from Fogo Island, Newfoundland, for example, has an extra beat at the end of the first strain that is not played in Irish versions of the tune. Newfoundland fiddler Rufus Guinchard is also well known for his repertoire of crooked tunes. Smith argues that the crookedness of these tunes is tied to local dancing practices that constituted the context and purpose for the performance of this type of music throughout much of Newfoundland’s history. As dances were generally accompanied by a solo performer, there was no need for musicians to keep in time with one another as in ensemble playing, allowing musicians to extend or shorten the length of strains based on the needs of the dancers.

Similarly, the style of playing tunes in Newfoundland is also seen as relating to the music’s purpose as an accompaniment for dance, where musicians ‘have little choice but to shrug your shoulders and realize that the important thing for those on the floor is that their feet hit the ground in time with the music’. Smith suggests that, since few dancers were formally trained, the simplest means for keeping dancers in time with the music is to emphasize each beat equally instead of subdivisions where dancers must complete a figure in a certain amount of time. Smith further explains that, as a result, traditional Newfoundland tunes ‘are played with few ornaments […] eighth notes and sixteenth notes are played with no “lilt” or “swing”’. This has led to the performance of polkas as singles – both types of tune are timed in 2/4, but with a single the beats are emphasized differently to produce a straighter sound – a stylistic practice considered to be unique to Newfoundland. ‘Crooked’ tunes and local styles of performance are therefore seen as tied to the character and history of Newfoundland through their performance by musicians and dancers.

Distinguishing and promoting this local ‘Newfoundland’ music played an important part in the local folk revival in the 1970s. Lise Saugeres, for example, explores how popular Newfoundland revival band Figgy Duff fostered a ‘nationalist identity’ through the promotion of ‘Newfoundland’ music. They simultaneously promoted the legitimacy of such a form of self-representation by collecting tunes and songs from rural communities throughout Newfoundland and performing them in local communities, along with larger formal venues such as the Arts and Culture Centres and internationally.
Yet, the promotion of a distinct Newfoundland style is often made in contradistinction to other genres of music. In particular, despite the many connections between Irish and Newfoundland music, the music of Newfoundland is often understood as distinct from and competing with Irish music, which has been seen to dominate musically as well as culturally. In other words, a significant factor in defining Newfoundland music, for some musicians, is precisely that it is not Irish music. Newfoundland singer Anita Best, for example, has argued against what she sees as ‘Irish cultural imperialism’, asserting that Newfoundland’s cultural traditions, including its music, should be understood as distinct from their Irish heritage. Similarly, in Wayne’s comment above, he distinguishes Newfoundland tunes as interesting and unique, and not simply a degenerate version of Irish music.

These debates over the ‘Irishness’ of Newfoundland and its music relate to different interpretations of how Irish and Newfoundland music is associated with Ireland and with Newfoundland. In one interpretation, Newfoundland music is distinct because of its historical associations to Newfoundland and its people, as opposed to Irish music, which is associated with Ireland and its people. Alternatively, traditional music in Newfoundland is associated with the ‘Irishness’ of the island through historical ties with Ireland and Irish music. Yet, the perspectives are similar in that the music is tied to the place or places from which it is seen to have originated and developed.

Making these distinctions is an important part of many musicians’ performance of Irish and Newfoundland music. Several musicians, for example, expressed an attachment specifically to Newfoundland music as a result of its association with the island. Frank, a self-proclaimed amateur musician from Newfoundland, for example, commented on his preference for playing Newfoundland tunes:

I think maybe it’s just a sentimental attachment. See, if they’re Newfoundland tunes, then maybe that’s when I feel like I have to try a bit harder to know them all, because of that. […] I’m not sure what it is but like there’s some other reason to [learn Newfoundland tunes]. There’s some extra meaning to a Newfoundland tune.

Through ideas that Newfoundland tunes ‘belong’ to Newfoundland, Frank suggests that there is a special meaning attached to them. Similarly, musicians create and maintain connections with Ireland, to their heritage and to friends and family there, through playing Irish music. Musicians, however, also create more localized relations with place that are often overlooked in debates over the ‘Irishness’ of the island and its music, which focus on musical origins and belonging in Ireland or Newfoundland.

Playing in Places and Creating Memories
When I asked musicians about whether they associated tunes with people and places, many of them recalled a great session down at so-and-so’s house a few years
back or a night at the pub during a snow-storm when no one was there but the musicians and the bartender. Gerry Strong, a Newfoundland flute-player who is also a member of Newfoundland band Tickle Harbour, for example, expressed:

There are so many it's hard to pick one out. One that comes to mind is the 'Dionne Reel'. I always think of the Harbour Inn when I play it. The Harbour Inn is where Frank Maher used to be a barman until it burned down back in the 1980s and was probably the only bar in town that was open to people going in and having a session in those days, thanks to Frank. It was there that I first got to play a session with Jackie Daly during which he played the 'Dionne Reel'. I didn't know it but Rob Murphy (a flute player from Cork who played with Tickle Harbour at the time) had his tape recorder going. After the session we listened to that tune in the car and got to work learning it. Now whenever I play it I can see us all around the table at the Harbour Inn and can almost smell the place – fond memories.42

Musicians also talked about memories of tunes they learned from their parents when they were young children, or from friends who have now passed on. Ian, for example, spoke of music he learned from his mother who has passed on:

I think the first memory I have of music being connected at all was my mother was always humming and singing Newfoundland songs when I was a kid. I remember sometimes getting sung or hummed to sleep. [...] Then, when I was still a child, my mother ordered me a little tiny piano accordion from a Sears catalogue [...] and my mother would show me stuff occasionally. I learned the 'Squid Jiggin’ Ground’ [from her]. [...] [Playing] it’s a connection with my mother, my past, so that’s important. It’s the best connection I have really.45

These associations, created as sounds and tunes that musicians learn and play, are integrated into musicians’ lives and their memories.

As Sally K. Sommers Smith observes of the performance of traditional Irish music:

Often, the people who have played the tune [...] are recalled in the making and remaking of the music. A traditional performer can be relied upon to add a personal stamp to the performance of the tune, but the musician from whom the tune was learned will also be recalled and named when the music is played in public.44

Ian’s first memories of music are associated with his mother who sung and hummed to him as a child. Similarly, the places where musicians learn and play tunes are recalled in the making and remaking of music. Gerry, for example, associated the ‘Dionne Reel’ with both who he learned it from and where he first heard and learned it. As one young Newfoundland musician told me: ‘It’s hard to put in words what I know about certain tunes, but it’s about the experience of learning them, like who
did you learn them off of, or where did you, what was it used for’. Thus, through the experience of playing tunes in particular places and with particular people, musicians create memories that link the music with those people and places.

This process is clearly seen in the photographs I asked two musicians, Rachel and Sandra, to take to represent what playing Irish and Newfoundland music meant to them. Rachel and Sandra are both from ‘away’, meaning not from Newfoundland, but have lived in St. John’s for nearly a decade. They are both members of Fiddle Group, an informal music group that meets every week at a member’s home to play Irish and Newfoundland music. Fiddle Group plays many ‘Newfoundland tunes’ that members have learned from local musicians, recordings, and sheet music. Most members also learn tunes that are part of the standard Irish session repertoire. Some have picked up tunes, for example, from the *Foinn Seisiún* tune books published by *Comhaltas Ceoltóirí Éireann* or from recordings of contemporary Irish bands. However, I discuss below how most of these musicians see all this music as being a part of the St. John’s music scene and relate their performance of it to their lives in Newfoundland. I also discuss how, for Rachel and Sandra, playing Irish and Newfoundland music provided them with a means to develop a sense of place in Newfoundland after having moved there and struggling to feel they belonged on the island.

Both musicians provided me with photographs of places in Newfoundland. For example, Rachel took a photograph of the dining room where Fiddle Group is often held. On the table, amongst other objects, are scattered sheets of music and her fiddle and bow. She associates the process of learning and playing traditional music with this particular room, describing the photo as ‘the room where the music has grown’. The association of music with particular places spreads out from that single room. Rachel also took a photograph of the house where the group meets and socializes. She also mentioned how the specific tune ‘Auntie Mary’ – one of the first tunes that the group learned – reminded her of Sally’s kitchen. (Sally is a mother of another member of Fiddle Group and the group first met to play at her house.) Similarly, Sandra took a picture of drawings that were compiled into a tableau of many of the locations that Fiddle Group has met throughout St. John’s, primarily the houses of members of the group, including Sally’s house, but also significant public locations associated with their music within St. John’s such as the Ship pub, O’Reilly’s Irish and Newfoundland pub, and the Duke pub.

As Ruth Finnegan observes in her analysis of musicians’ musical pathways – their musical experiences throughout their lives – in Milton Keynes, England:

> The musical pathways [...] can be envisaged as stretching out and crisscrossing through the town. [...] from the viewpoint of those with experience their pathways were punctuated by known landmarks. There were the houses of friends, colleagues and teachers, churches, schools or pubs where people had heard or given performances, halls where they had rehearsed, streets or squares where they had witnessed a brass band or a Morris group performance,
shops where they had bought music or displayed their posters. [...] Musical participants marked out their own social and spatial settings by the pathways they drew through the town and in the venues and actions which in a sense constituted and sanctified these paths.48

Thus, as depicted in Sandra’s tableau, music becomes not only associated with a room in a house, but also with particular buildings, venues, and other meeting places throughout St. John’s. These places are thereby incorporated as part of musicians’ lives, becoming familiar and meaningful as musicians play in them or pass through them at sessions each week.

These experiences and associations can also be recalled through playing music. Sara Cohen considers the vivid evocation of memories that occurs through listening to, dancing to, and playing music seen through the life of an elderly Jewish man.49 ‘Just one simple musical phrase can simultaneously represent a private world of memory and desire’ through which musicians thereby recall the places where that music was previously produced.50 This is seen, for example, in Ben’s recollections of when he moved away to the Canadian mainland for a time. Ben is a musician who was born and grew up in Newfoundland and has played traditional music since he was a young child. Ben recalled that when he moved away for university, ‘that’s when I really started to practice, ‘cause I was homesick, oh my, was I ever homesick. And I found a really good therapy for me was to play music from here [Newfoundland], you know’.51 Ben specifically recalls the tune ‘Johnny Has Gone Away’, which he learned from a recording of his grandfather. He noted:

> When I play it now, I think of him of course, I think of the fact that I never played until after he had passed away which means that he never got to hear me play. Kind of makes me a bit sad. [...] In terms of a time in my life, this was one of the first tunes I ever learned, so in addition to associating it with my grandfather, I also associate it with a time in my life when I had just left home to attend university. [...] When I look back on those times, I realize how lucky I was then to have as much time to play then as I did. [...] ‘Johnny Has Gone Away’ brings back all those feelings and memories and it will forever be a special tune to me because of it.52

This tune evokes for Ben multiple meanings and associations. It is tied in with his grandfather and his home, and reminds him of his times on the mainland at university.

While Ben made these local and personal associations with the music he plays, he also told me that he often prefers playing Irish music because he finds it fun. He associates it with the history of his community and of his family, seeing many connections between Ireland and Newfoundland and their music. In our talks Ben suggested that there may only be a Newfoundland style of playing, rather than Newfoundland music as such, since all music in Newfoundland had influences from elsewhere. He comments that the Newfoundland style is ‘very fast, very
driving’, similar to Smith’s description above. In distinguishing Newfoundland music based on style alone, Ben emphasizes the Irish influence on Newfoundland music. Even so, while he was away on the mainland, Ben recalled connections to local places: to his home and to his grandfather and his family on the island. Now, he also thinks of his time away at university learning this music. These recollections occurred as he played the music he learned in those places and with those people.

Thus, through the performance of ‘Newfoundland’, ‘Irish’, and other music, musicians create associations between specific locations and the music they play. They do so as they play the music in these places and through the memories and stories they form about them. They re-establish these connections and associations, as well as create new ones, as tunes are played at a later date and in new locations. The ties between memories, music, and place are therefore continuously changing and evolving throughout musicians’ lives. The music Ben associates with home is different if he is playing in St. John’s than if he is playing on the Canadian mainland. New associations are also incorporated and interwoven in complex ways as he continues to play in new places. As this process continues through time, Irish and Newfoundland music become part of musicians’ experiences of Newfoundland and the associations between music and place extend to represent Newfoundland as a whole. The idea that Irish and Newfoundland music ‘belongs’ to the island is thereby created, even as it is acknowledged that the music may not have originated in Newfoundland.

Creating Musical Roots

As a result of the various local connections that musicians form through the performance of traditional Irish and Newfoundland music, it is often difficult to separate precisely where musicians situate their music. Some would jump between talking about music in Ireland to talking about the same music in Newfoundland, discussing the historical ties of the music and personal relations in particular places on both sides of the Atlantic. A discussion I had with Billy Sutton will clarify my point. Billy plays at and hosts many sessions in St. John’s and has a varied repertoire of Irish and Newfoundland music, as well as musical genres other than traditional music. In our discussions Billy moved between talking about the history of music in Newfoundland and regional styles in Ireland almost seamlessly. He talked about the Sliabh Luachra style of music from County Kerry and Cork in Ireland and simultaneously about its performance in Newfoundland, introduced by Séamus Creagh and Rob Murphy in the 1980s and 1990s.

These complexities are created as musicians continue to play music in particular places across Newfoundland, creating ties between music and local places regardless of tune origins. The music thereby becomes part of the music scene in these places and shapes musicians’ own and others’ experiences of it alongside of the island’s music. For musicians entering the St. John’s music scene, for example, Irish music is often simply a part of their experiences of playing with other musicians and at sessions. As one member of Fiddle Group expressed, ‘you can’t
live in St. John's and not be affected by Irish music and the whole Irish culture. It's an underpinning of this particular area." The music itself is thereby seen as local through its performance by local musicians at sessions in St. John's.

Music from Irish recordings played on 'Irish' instruments, such as the uilleann pipes and Irish-tuned accordions is then seen as an extension of these ties. An extract from a discussion found on 'The Session' website regarding the import of a C#/D accordion to the local music scene by accordion player Graham Wells is particularly illustrative of how influences from Ireland are adapted by Newfoundland musicians and related to Newfoundland.

Stjohnsman [9 February 2008]: Speaking from experience, the vast bulk of older accordions in Newfoundland are either C/G or A/D. Single row accordions are either D, G or A, with the odd C turning up as well. Graham Wells and a few other younger guys who are into emulating Irish players are moving into C#/D, but that is a very recent phenomena. Bob Hallett of Great Big Sea plays two-row Hohners, as does Mark Hiscock of Shanneyganock. Their wet-tuned sound would probably be considered 'Newfoundland style' by most locals who have any interest in this. […]

Buck [28 February 2008]: […] By the way, st.john'sman. The number of players learning or switching to C#/D or B/C is a lot higher than you seem to know. These players are not emulating Irish players, they are playing Newfoundland music. The box is evolving in Newfoundland my friend. The capabilities of the Irish tuned boxes are a tremendous advantage and are in my opinion better suited to Newfoundland dance music.56

Stjohnsman suggests that players in Newfoundland are simply 'emulating' Irish players by using 'Irish' instruments and playing 'Irish' tunes. Buck, however, argues they are not playing them simply because they are 'Irish'. He maintains links of continuity in suggesting that musicians 'are playing Newfoundland music' but are adapting new instruments to the music and to the local music scene. The capabilities of the C#/D box refer to the recognition that it is more versatile in sessions, allowing musicians to play in multiple keys, whereas the 'older' accordions, in two keys, limit the breadth of tunes a musician can play and thereby their ability to participate. In this manner, while the music and the instruments are acknowledged to be 'Irish' in origin, they are also considered to be part of Newfoundland music as musicians relate the music's performance to their experiences and lives in Newfoundland and to the music's history on the island.

Musicians come to associate the Irish music that they play not just with specific places in Newfoundland, but with Newfoundland as a whole. For example, in addition to the photographs of particular rooms, houses and other buildings in St. John's, Rachel also provided photographs of two popular St. John's landmarks – evening settings of both St. John's harbour and Signal Hill. Signal Hill is one of the best-known sights in St. John's. It is often taken to stand for 'historic St. John's' and
is therefore a symbol for the city and for Newfoundland. Ideas that I have already discussed, about how traditional music is associated with certain places, shape Rachel’s association of the music she plays with the island. Rachel, however, does not simply relate the music to Signal Hill as a landmark, but to her experience of the place. She says, ‘the music has a sense of old in it always, just like an evening walk up Signal Hill’.57 Through her experiences of playing music in specific locations and of living in Newfoundland, she links the island with the music.

Thus, as music is played in various places throughout Newfoundland, the idea that particular tunes and music originates from and belongs to Newfoundland is established and maintained. Yet, new ties between music and place are also created. Tunes that may have originated in Ireland are associated with a new context in Newfoundland through musicians’ experiences of playing in St. John’s or elsewhere in Newfoundland. The ‘Squid Jiggin' Ground’ that Ian mentions is originally an Irish tune known as ‘Larry O’Gaff’.58 These origins, however, are of little significance compared to the connection to his mother and his past. Similarly, the ‘Dionne Reel’, discussed by Gerry, is generally considered to be a French Canadian tune, which he learned from Irish accordion player Jackie Daly and alongside Irish musician Rob Murphy, who I discussed above. Yet, the tune also evokes for Gerry memories of the Harbour Inn, a pub in St. John’s that is no longer in existence. The music is thereby seen to have roots on the island. Of course, these new ties between music and place contribute to the debates over Irish and Newfoundland music and their relation to Ireland and Newfoundland. Nevertheless, through this process, musicians are able to establish a sense of rootedness in Newfoundland.

Creating Personal Roots

Most musicians in St. John’s were clear in identifying themselves as being from Newfoundland, or as relating to Newfoundland because of residence here, even as they played both ‘Irish’ and ‘Newfoundland’ music. For example, I asked Billy Sutton, ‘Do you ever find that people sort of assume you’re Irish or try to be Irish because you play this music?’ He responded that he had not thought about it much but that people were free to assume what they wanted. I followed up wondering whether any assumptions bothered him and he said ‘it doesn’t bother me at all, no, doesn’t bother me at all. I’m from Newfoundland and I’ll be quick to tell somebody really fast where I’m from’.59 From Billy’s discussions, it is clear he knows much about Ireland and has a relationship with the place through people and knowledge of its history. Yet, Billy also identifies with Newfoundland, ‘where I’m from’.

In their critique of ideas of identification and belonging that are commonly explored in relation to musical performance, Keith Negus and Patria Román Velázquez argue that scholars have the tendency to assume a homologous relationship between musical identification and musical genre.60 In particular, in order to understand the form of identification expressed through the performance of Irish music, scholars must necessarily assume that those performing the music are ‘Irish’ in turn. In other words, there is a tendency to focus on meanings and
identifications that are associated with where a particular musical genre is seen to originate and belong. Certainly, many scholars see the playing of Irish music in areas of the Irish diaspora as a way for musicians to reclaim their Irish roots and its performance is seen as tied to an expression of ‘Irishness’.\(^{61}\) Negus and Velázquez say that to take a thoroughly non-essentialist stance, ‘then we would have to accept that any type of musical sound (however categorised) could “construct” us any type of social identity.’\(^{62}\) It is precisely the perspective necessary to understand the performance of traditional music by musicians like Billy in Newfoundland.

Regardless of tune origins, through the performance of music in places, musicians are able to construct a sense of identification and connectedness in Newfoundland. This is clearly seen with Rachel and Sandra who moved to Newfoundland ‘from away’. Rachel discussed:

> It really does put you more in this place. If I didn’t have that [the music] I don’t know that I would feel as connected to Newfoundland, definitely, definitely. Yeah, East Coast trail or not, I don’t think I’d feel as connected to this place. I almost feel in some ways that I have a bigger connection than some people who are from here who don’t know what ‘Auntie Mary’ is.\(^{63}\)

As discussed above, the tune ‘Auntie Mary’, to which Rachel refers, is common in the Newfoundland repertoire, yet, it has origins in Scotland.\(^{64}\) Interestingly, the connection Rachel makes to Newfoundland through the music she plays is stronger than the connection she feels experiencing the physical geography of the island represented by the East Coast trail, which she sometimes hikes.

Sheaukang Hew, an ethnomusicologist who grew up in Malaysia, makes a similar conclusion in locating the music she played in central Oklahoma. She reflects, ‘this music, be it Irish, Celtic, or old-time has helped me cross the ethnic boundary and find my place in American society’\(^{65}\). Sandra also discussed how she felt when she was learning and becoming a part of Newfoundland ‘culture’, as she met other musicians and learned about the place and its people, including how to make local Newfoundland dishes such as toutons and moose stew\(^{66}\). As seen in Ben’s discussion, musicians who were born in Newfoundland maintain a sense of rootedness in the island through playing Irish and Newfoundland music. The connections musicians create through playing this music are therefore an important part of their lives in Newfoundland. As a result, the connections and identifications that musicians create through the performance of traditional Irish music are not necessarily related to Ireland, nor are they always tied to an expression of ‘Irishness’. These connections are local and specific to musicians’ experiences of playing in the city of St. John’s.

**Conclusion: Multiple Roots**

There has been much debate in Newfoundland about the legitimacy and implication of describing Newfoundland music as ‘Irish’. Likewise, the playing of Irish music
outside of Ireland is often taken as a way of claiming a connection to Ireland. However, these approaches to placing Irish music – by associating it with Ireland or ideas of an Irish Newfoundland – miss the more localized and personal meanings that musicians create through their music. They also miss the multiple ways that musicians can use music to create ties to multiple places. Music in Newfoundland means different things to different musicians and in many cases it means multiple things to a single musician. Ties between music and place are formed based on from where the music is considered to have originated and from where it developed – but also in where it is now played and where musicians place the music in terms of their performance of it and in their memories and experiences.

Appendix

This appendix contains an annotated listing of tunes and their origins from one hour of a Friday night session at Erin’s Pub, St. John’s, Newfoundland. Tunes found in well-known Irish collections such as Francis O’Neill’s *The Dance Music of Ireland. 1001 Gems* (henceforth referred to as O’Neill’s DMOI), and Breandán Breathnach’s five-volume *Ceol Rince na hÉireann* are considered to be traditional Irish tunes. However, tunes with known composers from the twentieth and twenty-first centuries are considered contemporary. Alan Ng’s index of Irish tunes was an invaluable resource and used extensively in tracing tune origins.

Set 1:
- ‘Old Tipperary’: Traditional Irish tune – Breathnach, I, no. 23.
- ‘Rose in the Heather’: Traditional Irish tune – Breathnach, I, no. 37.
- ‘Up in the Air’: Contemporary Irish tune – composed and recorded by Irish musicians Kevin Burke and Mícheál Ó Domhnaill in 1982.

Set 2:
- ‘Martin Wynne’s no.1’: Contemporary Irish tune – composed by Irish musician Martin Wynne.
- ‘College Groves’: Traditional Irish tune – O’Neill’s DMOI, no. 485.
- ‘Pinch of Snuff’: Traditional Irish tune – Breathnach, II, no. 182.

Set 3:

Set 4:
- ‘The Silver Slipper’: Irish tune, likely traditional – composer unknown.
- ‘The Boys of Ballisodare’: Traditional Irish tune – O’Neill’s DMOI, no. 587.

Set 5:

Set 6:
- ‘Collier’s Reel’: Traditional Irish tune – O’Neill’s DMOI, no. 646.
- ‘The Shaskeen Reel’: Traditional Irish tune – O’Neill’s DMOI, no. 802.

Set 7:
- ‘Paddy from Portlaw’: Traditional Irish tune – O’Neill’s DMOI, no. 47.

Notes
1 Thanks to Robin Whitaker for her helpful suggestions and advice for this paper. I would like to thank the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC), the Institute for Social...
BRESLIN Putting down roots: playing Irish and Newfoundland music in St. John’s

and Economic Research (ISER), and the A.G. Hatcher Memorial Scholarship for their generous funding provided in support of this project, completed as part of my Master’s research.

1 A common definition of belonging used in Newfoundland relates to ideas of place. As described by the Dictionary of Newfoundland English, to belong is ‘to be a native of; to come from’. G. M. Story, W. J. Kirwin, and J. D. A. Widdowson, eds, Dictionary of Newfoundland English Online, 2nd edn (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999), s.v. ‘belong’.


4 I am following Margaret C. Rodman’s work on ‘multi-vocality’ and ‘multi-locality’ where she argues for scholars to consider the multiple ways in which physical space can be imbued with meaning. She explores how ‘places, like voices, are local and multiple. For each inhabitant, a place has a unique reality, one in which meaning is shared with other people and places’ (p. 643). That is, places are experienced and conceptualized in multiple and sometimes contested ways and through various means, which are based on connections among people, places, and historical contexts. For some, Newfoundland is an ‘Irish place’, whereas others in Newfoundland see it as unique and distinct from its Irish heritage. Margaret C. Rodman, ‘Empowering Place: Multilocality and Multivocality’, American Anthropologist, 94 (1992), 640–56.

5 St. John’s is the capital city of a province whose political boundaries encompass both Newfoundland and Labrador. My research, however, focuses specifically on the island of Newfoundland. I frequently use ‘the island’ to refer to this particular part of the province.

6 I focus on ‘Newfoundland’ and ‘Irish’ categories. It is, however, important to note that it is equally difficult to distinguish ‘Newfoundland’ music from ‘English’ music or ‘US American’ music, which have also significantly influenced music in Newfoundland. ‘Irish music’ is similarly ill-defined as a category since traditional music in Ireland is an amalgam of influences from places such as Scotland, England, and the United States over many centuries. See, for example, Helen O’Shea, The Making of Irish Traditional Music, pp. 5–52; Mícheál Ó Súilleabháin, ‘Irish Music Defined’, The Crane Bag, 5 (1981), 83–87.


10 Evelyn Osborne, ‘Crossing Over through the Recording Studio: The Island to Island: Traditional Music from Ireland and Newfoundland CD Project’, in Crossing Over: Fiddle and Dance Studies from around the North Atlantic 3, ed. by Ian Russell and Anna Kearney Guigne (Aberdeen: Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, in association with the Department of Folklore, MMaP and the School of Music, Memorial University, Newfoundland, 2010), 49–67 (pp. 52–55).


Informal sessions previously took place at the Harbour Inn, a pub managed by well-known Newfoundland musician Frank Maher beginning in 1959. He would often allow musicians to bring their instruments and hold unscheduled sessions, joining in himself sometimes. However, only with Murphy and Creagh’s influence did sessions become a regular feature of venues where musicians could gather, socialize and perform traditional music. Interviews by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.


A session held at the Georgetown Pub on Tuesday evening, for example, offers an online listing of the tunes and sets that are commonly played there. One set consists of ‘Cooley’s Reel’/‘Jim Hodder’s Reel’/‘The Banshee’. ‘Cooley’s Reel’ and ‘The Banshee’ are common Irish tunes, both found in Breandán Breathnach, Ceol Rince na hÉireann trans by Paul de Grae online <http://www.nigelgatherer.com/books/CRE/>, 5 vols (Baile Átha Cliath [Dublin]: An G m, 1963–1999) , I (1963), no. 200, II (1976), no. 273 [accessed 2 December 2009]. ‘Jim Hodder’s’, on the other hand, was composed by Newfoundland fiddler Émile Benoit. Kelly Russell, p. 49.

Joshua D. Lalor, ‘Exploring the Implications of “Policy” through the Memorandum of Understanding between Newfoundland and Labrador and Ireland’ (unpublished master’s report, Memorial University of Newfoundland, 2008), p. 15.


This tri-color flag is not the official flag of the province of Newfoundland and Labrador, but is nonetheless commonly seen around the island. Johanne Devlin Trew, p. 54.

Joshua D. Lalor, ‘Exploring the Implications of “Policy”’. 172
BRESLIN Putting down roots: playing Irish and Newfoundland music in St. John’s

24 Johnanne Devlin Trew, p. 44.
28 It is found, for example, in *Scottish Fiddle Tunes* ([n.p.]: [n.pub.], 1903; repr. Cork: Ossian, 1985), no. 53.
29 Evelyn Osborne, ‘Crossing Over’, p. 58.
30 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.
31 Christina Smith, pp. 142.
32 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009. I use pseudonyms throughout this article in order to protect musicians’ privacy, except where I have received explicit permission to use musicians’ real names or their names are already found on the public record. In these exceptional cases, I will introduce musicians using both their first and last names.
33 Evelyn Osborne, ‘Crossing Over’, p. 60.
34 Evelyn Osborne, ‘Fiddling with Technology’, p. 189; Christina Smith, pp. 146–47.
35 Christina Smith, pp. 151, 153–54.
36 Christina Smith, p. 158.
37 Christina Smith, pp. 157–58.
38 Christina Smith, p. 142. For a more detailed discussion of performance styles in Newfoundland and how they relate to Irish performance styles, see Bridget O’Connell, ‘A Comparative Study of Newfoundland and Irish Fiddle Styles’, in *Transcultural Perspectives on Canada*, ed. by Klaus-Dieter Ertler and Paulina Mickiewicz (Brno, Czech Republic: Central European Association for Canadian Studies in collaboration with Masaryk University, 2007), pp. 89–111.
40 Anita Best, quoted in Lise Saugeres, p. 103.
41 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.
42 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2012.
43 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.
45 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.
46 For a more thorough description of self-reporting projects that is reflective of the way I used them with Rachel and Sandra, see Wayne Fife, *Doing Fieldwork: Ethnographic Methods for Research in Developing Countries and Beyond* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 107–16. These projects were conducted as an assignment for a course entitled ‘Fieldwork and Interpretation of Culture’ from Dr Wayne Fife as part of my degree and prior to my formal fieldwork period.
47 Self-reporting project, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2008.
49 Sara Cohen, p. 444.
50 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.
51 Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2012.
52 While an increasing number of tunes in Newfoundland are written down, when performed in an aural context alone there is limited separation between the structure of tunes and their performance. Bridget O’Connell, for example, includes tune structure in her description of style (p. 91). Nevertheless, musicians like Ben use these ideas separately in trying to understand and define the music they play.

Accordions in Newfoundland prior to the past decade were primarily diatonic, known elsewhere as melodeons. These were single row or double row accordions able to play in one or two keys. Graham Wells is said to have introduced the first chromatically tuned button accordion to the St. John’s music scene. Doris Maul Fair provides a thorough discussion of how these accordions became associated with Irish music, such that they are often referred to as ‘Irish tuned’ button accordions. These double-row accordions are able to play in any key and are generally tuned either C#/D or B/C along the rows. Fair similarly shows how this accordion has uncertain but likely European origins and argues ‘when the Irish got their hands on the instrument, accordion music in Ireland changed, and with it, the traditional music’ (p. 118). Irish musicians adopted and adapted this instrument into their music thereby making it a part of the music scenes in Ireland. The instrument and the music was also picked up by other musicians and continued to develop in new contexts around the world, including Newfoundland. See Doris Maul Fair, ‘Billy’s Box: Material Culture, Musical Idiom, and Musicanship in Irish Button Accordion’ (unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Pennsylvania, 2009).

I have copied this excerpt as it was posted, including spelling and typographic errors: ‘2 Row Accordion Tunings for Newfoundland Traditional Music’, discussions (2007–2009), see <https://thesession.org/discussions/13294#comment274031> [accessed 23 November 2010].

Self-reporting project, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2008.

O’Neill, no. 128.

Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.


Negus and Velázquez, p. 137.

Interview by author, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2009.

These musicians acknowledge differences between ‘Irish’ and ‘Newfoundland’ music and generally have an understanding of the significance of such distinctions and the significance of debates over what constitutes the music of Newfoundland. Nevertheless, the music (be it Irish or Newfoundland) is all a part of their experiences of living in Newfoundland.


Self-reporting project, St. John’s, Newfoundland, Canada, 2008.

Alan Ng, ‘irishtune.info Irish Traditional Music Tune Index’, <http://www.irishtune.info> [accessed 1 April, 2012].


Alan Ng, ‘Tune ID#2107 (Martin Wynne’s)’, <http://www.irishtune.info/tune/2107/> [accessed 14 April, 2012].

The particular setting played in the session, which features key changes between six parts, seems to originate from Kevin Burke, *If the Cap Fits*, Green Linnet, GLCD 3009, Nashville, Tennessee, US, 1978.


BRESLIN Putting down roots: playing Irish and Newfoundland music in St. John’s